The Planning Inspectorate

Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 15 December 2016

by Louise Crosby MA MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government

Decision date: 19 December 2016

Appeal Ref: APP/R2520/D/16/3158820
The Old Barn, 21 Clint Lane, Navenby, Lincoln, LN5 0EX

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
- The appeal is made by Mrs Charlotte Rimmer against the decision of North Kesteven District Council.
- The application Ref: 16/0697/HOUS, dated 7 June 2016, was refused by notice dated 19 August 2016.
- The development proposed is installation of woodgrain effect uPVC windows.

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Main Issues

2. The main issues are whether the proposed windows would preserve or enhance the character or appearance of Navenby Conservation Area (NCA) and the effect they would have on the character, appearance and significance of the host property which is a non-designated heritage asset.

Reasons

3. The appeal property is a converted agricultural barn, now in residential use. The simple 2 storey building is constructed from stone under a clay pantile roof. The existing windows throughout the building are timber framed. There are small, simple dark coloured aluminium framed rooflights in the roof. It appears that the windows and rooflights were installed when the building was converted around 20 years ago. The property is set back from and at a higher level than No 19, a grade II listed building which fronts onto Clint Lane. Its significance is derived from its age, traditional style and its agricultural origins.

4. The surrounding area contains a wide variety of dwelling styles and ages. I saw that a number of houses in the surrounding area, which are also within the NCA, have various styles of uPVC windows. However, these tend to be the more modern dwellings and where the Council have no control over replacement windows. The older, more traditional properties, contain either original or replacement timber windows.

5. The 1993 planning permission for the conversion of this barn to a dwelling and the recent planning applications for extensions all contain planning conditions which remove permitted development rights for any alterations, including

replacement windows, thereby allowing the Council to retain control of such things in relation to this building.

6. The Council's draft Navenby Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (August 2016) notes the specific future threat to the character and appearance of NCA associated with the replacement of timber windows with more modern materials, such as uPVC. It also identifies the appeal property as one that makes a positive contribution to NCA. I note that this document is in draft form and is not adopted policy of the Council that has been subject to public consultation and therefore it carries only a modest amount of weight. That said, it is commonly accepted practice that timber windows are normally more appropriate in historic settings such as in conservation areas.

7. I saw when I visited the site that the existing timber windows are very simple in design to reflect the former use of the building. By contrast, the proposed UPVC windows would have much bulkier frames which are not characteristic of windows in agricultural buildings or indeed in older buildings. In addition, uPVC, even with a woodgrain effect has a shiner more fabricated and uniform appearance than painted timber. As such they would appear incongruous in this building and within this location.

8. While there are limited views of the windows from the public highway or the nearby public footpath, there are some views and they would also be seen from the surrounding dwellings.

9. I consider that the proposed windows would fail to preserve the character or appearance of the NCA and harm the character, appearance and significance of the former agricultural building. As such, the proposal would conflict with adopted North Kesteven Local Plan 2007 policy C18 which seeks to protect the character and appearance of the surroundings of the site and policy HE7 which, among other things, seeks to ensure that alterations to buildings in conservation areas preserve or enhance their character, setting and appearance.

10. For the reasons given above and having regard to all other matters raised, I conclude that the appeal should be dismissed.

Louise Crosby

INSPECTOR