
Appeal Decisions

Site visit made on 13 March 2017

by Jonathan Hockley BA(Hons) DipTP MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government

Decision date: 31 March 2017

Appeal A: APP/C3105/W/16/3155874

Lower Green Farm, Horton cum Studley, Oxon OX33 1AP

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr James Douglas against the decision of Cherwell District Council.
 - The application Ref 16/00849/F, dated 4 May 2016, was refused by notice dated 1 July 2016.
 - The development proposed is to convert the single storey outbuilding to become part of the Main Lower Green Farm House, to form an external glazed link to the outbuilding with a new single storey Garden Room between the existing farm house and outbuilding.
-

Appeal B: APP/C3105/Y/16/3155723

Lower Green Farm, Horton cum Studley, Oxon OX33 1AP

- The appeal is made under section 20 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 against a refusal to grant listed building consent.
 - The appeal is made by Mr James Douglas against the decision of Cherwell District Council.
 - The application Ref 16/00850/LB, dated 4 May 2016, was refused by notice dated 1 July 2016.
 - The works proposed are to convert the single storey outbuilding to become part of the Main Lower Green Farm House, to form an external glazed link to the outbuilding with a new single storey Garden Room between the existing farm house and outbuilding.
-

Decisions

1. Appeal A is allowed and planning permission is granted to convert the single storey outbuilding to become part of the Main Lower Green Farm House, to form an external glazed link to the outbuilding with a new single storey Garden Room between the existing farm house and outbuilding at Lower Green Farm, Horton cum Studley, Oxon OX33 1AP in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref 16/00849/F, dated 4 May 2016, subject to the conditions set out at the end of my decisions.
 2. Appeal B is allowed and listed building consent is granted to convert the single storey outbuilding to become part of the Main Lower Green Farm House, to form an external glazed link to the outbuilding with a new single storey Garden Room between the existing farm house and outbuilding at Lower Green Farm, Horton cum Studley, Oxon OX33 1AP in accordance with the terms of the application Ref 16/00850/LB dated 4 May 2016 subject to the conditions set out at the end of my decisions.
-

Preliminary Matters and Main Issue

3. The appeal site lies within the Green Belt. However, there is no dispute between the parties that the proposal would not be inappropriate development, and based on all that I have seen and read I have no reason to disagree with this view.
4. The main issue in both appeals is whether the proposed works would preserve the special architectural and historical interest of the Grade II listed building and its setting.

Reasons

5. Lower Green farmhouse is a large residential property located to the north west of the settlement of Horton cum Studley. Church Lane heads west from a crossroads at the centre of the village, and has residential development on its south side until Ragnall's Lane splits off to the north. The remainder of Church Lane is then set in open agricultural countryside. The Lane stops at a grouping of farms, with Lower Green Farm being located on the north side of the road.
6. The Grade II listed two storey farmhouse was, according to the listing, constructed in the early to mid-18th century. The home is constructed in red brick and limestone rubble with a plain tile roof. The façade of the building faces towards the south east, overlooking a garden area and the fields separating the farmhouse from the village. The façade has a symmetrical 3 bay frontage with a central door under a tiled canopy and narrower window above. A range to the right has a half hipped and a catslide tiled roof. The left gable end of the building is constructed in rubble with a noticeable central red brick flush chimney stack.
7. The lane tracks around to the left of the building, and is bordered by a single storey pitched roof outbuilding with red brick and rubble at ground floor level and weatherboarded gable under the tiled roof. The rear of this outbuilding is two storeys high; this element of the outbuilding is far more substantial with prominent buttresses to side and a glass element in the visible gable end above the single storey element. Further outbuildings lie to the north, including a further Grade II listed weatherboarded timber framed barn.
8. The significance of the farmhouse, as far as its exterior is concerned, derives essentially from its architectural quality and detailing, and its prominent setting facing towards the village. This setting is enhanced by the property's positioning on slightly higher ground than the village centre. The outbuildings in the farmyard behind the property to the north and west add to the setting of the farmhouse, with the well-designed two storey outbuilding to the left forming a clear stepping up from the single storey element.
9. Policy ESD15 of the Local Plan¹ and policies C28 and C30 of the old Local Plan² together state that development will conserve, sustain and enhance heritage assets and ensure that new development is sensitively sited and integrated, and that control will be exercised over all development to ensure that the layout, design, scale, and external appearance is sympathetic to the character of its context and street scene.

¹ The Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031, July 2015

² Cherwell Local Plan November 1996

10. The Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires special interest to be given to the desirability of preserving a listed building and any features or architectural interest it possesses. Section 66 (1) states that, when considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects the setting of a listed building, special regard should be had to the desirability of preserving this setting. Paragraph 132 of the National Planning Policy Framework (the Framework) says when considering the impact of a proposal on the significance of a heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation.
11. The proposal seeks to convert the single storey outbuilding from storage uses into additional residential accommodation for the farmhouse. This outbuilding would then be connected to the main house with a flat 'green' roofed extension with weather boarded walls. The gable of the existing outbuilding would be replaced with glass detailing to match the exiting two storey outbuilding gable. The flat roofed garden room extension would be sited to a point just overlapping the main farmhouse, but not as far as its noticeable chimney stack. A glazed link would connect from the side of the garden room, across the rear of the farmhouse to connect to an existing west facing door, where the tiled roof would be slightly extended to meet. A slate terrace would be created alongside the farmhouse in front of the garden room, bordered by a vine arbour along the lane edge.
12. The siting and placement of the garden room would be fully subordinate to the principal elevation of the listed building, being set back and of single storey height. The Council are of the opinion that the design of the garden room is blunt; however, the extension would continue the attractive stepped arrangement of the outbuildings visible from the lane, with the flat sedum roof giving way to the glazed pitched roof of the single storey outbuilding, in turn stepping up to the glazed gable of the two storey outbuilding.
13. Whilst the proposals would remove the physical separation between the farmhouse and its outbuildings, this would be done in a low key, entirely subordinate manner. The scale and design of the extension would reduce its prominence in the street scene, and its extent, just overlapping the western elevation of the principal building would ensure that this structure would maintain its prominence in the street scene, allowing the farmhouse to remain largely visually separate, leaving the main façade untouched and the brick stack on the west side fully visible. The siting of the extension would also continue the built arrangement of the existing outbuildings along the side of the lane and would be sensitive to its rural context.
14. The glazed link would extend across the rear of the farmhouse, but would be of minimal width and is detailed as being very simple in design, consisting of frameless double glazing with an internal lightweight steel structure. The top of the glass would be above the two rear ground floor windows of the farmhouse, allowing these and their brick arches to remain fully visible and the width of the link, stated as 900mm by the appellant, would not be conducive to domestic paraphernalia 'cluttering up' the link structure. Such a link would be fully subordinate, lightweight and delicate and would not harm the architectural interest of the listed building.
15. I therefore conclude that the proposal would preserve the special architectural and historical interest of the Grade II listed building and its setting. The

proposal would comply with the Framework, Policy ESD15 of the Local Plan and policies C28 and C30 of the old Local Plan.

Conditions

16. I have imposed the standard conditions relating to compliance with plans and time for implementation on both decisions, in the interests of the proper planning of the area and for the avoidance of doubt. I have also imposed conditions requiring details of materials for the garden room and the glazed link on both consents. I agree with the Council that a condition requiring landscaping details and maintenance schedule for the proposed green roof is necessary given the prominent location of the proposal; such a condition is imposed on Appeal A.

Conclusion

17. For the reasons given above, and taking into account all other matters raised, I conclude that the appeals should be allowed.

Jon Hockley

INSPECTOR

SCHEDULE OF CONDITIONS

Appeal A

- 1) The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than three years from the date of this decision.
- 2) Except where otherwise stipulated by conditions attached to this permission, the development shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the application forms, Design and Access Statement and plans numbered: DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 01, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 02, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 10, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 11, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 12, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 13, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 14, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 15, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 16, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 17, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 18
- 3) Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, samples of the timberboarding shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the development shall be carried out in accordance with the samples so approved.
- 4) Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, a landscaping scheme and landscape management plan for the green roof, including timing of implementation of the plan, maintenance schedule and procedures for the replacement of any failed planting, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the landscaping and landscape management plan shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- 5) Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, full details of all openings and the glazed link, including colour/finish and cross section, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local

Planning Authority. Thereafter, the doors, windows and glazed link shall be installed within the buildings in accordance with the approved details.

Appeal B

- 1) The works hereby authorised shall begin not later than 3 years from the date of this consent.
- 2) Except where otherwise stipulated by conditions attached to this permission, the works shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the application forms, Design and Access Statement and plans numbered: DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 01, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 02, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 10, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 11, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 12, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 13, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 14, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 15, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 16, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 17, DHFHcS 3₂₀₁₆ 18.
- 3) Prior to the commencement of the works hereby approved, samples of the timber boarding shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the works shall be carried out in accordance with the samples so approved.
- 4) Prior to the commencement of the works hereby approved, full details of all openings and the glazed link, including colour/finish and cross section, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the doors, windows and glazed link shall be installed within the buildings in accordance with the approved details.