
Appeal Decisions

Site visit made on 4 July 2017

by R Barrett BSc (Hons) MSc Dip UD Dip Hist Cons MRTPI IHBC

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government

Decision date: 17th July 2017

Appeal Ref: APP/N1730/W/17/3172324 (Appeal A)

Yew Tree Cottage, Dippenhall Street, Crondall, Farnham GU10 5NX

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Matthew Simkins against the decision of Hart District Council.
 - The application Ref 16/01334/HOU, dated 19 May 2016, was refused by notice dated 4 January 2017.
 - The development proposed is 'proposed extension, addition of a dormer window and works to garden walls'.
-

Appeal Ref: APP/N1730/Y/17/3172329 (Appeal B)

Yew Tree Cottage, Dippenhall Street, Crondall, Farnham GU10 5NX

- The appeal is made under section 20 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 against a refusal to grant listed building consent.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Matthew Simkins against the decision of Hart District Council.
 - The application Ref 16/01335/LBC, dated 19 May 2016, was refused by notice dated 5 January 2017.
 - The works proposed are 'proposed extension, addition of a dormer window and works to garden walls'.
-

Decisions

1. Appeal A is allowed and planning permission is granted for proposed extension, and works to garden walls, at Yew Tree Cottage, Dippenhall Street, Crondall, Farnham GU10 5NX, in accordance with planning application Ref 16/01334/HOU, dated 19 May 2016, subject to the planning conditions set out in Annex A to my decisions.
2. Appeal B is allowed and listed building consent is granted for proposed extension and works to garden walls at Yew Tree Cottage, Dippenhall Street, Crondall, Farnham GU10 5NX, in accordance with listed building consent application Ref 16/01335/LBC, dated 19 May 2016, subject to the conditions set out in Annex B to my decisions.

Procedural Matters

3. Appeal A and Appeal B relate to the same site. Whilst I have considered each proposal on its own merits, given that they have much in common, and in the interests of brevity, I have dealt with them in one document.
4. The Council has confirmed in paragraph 2.9 of its statement of case, that its objection to the front boundary wall could be overcome by the submission of appropriate details. I have made my decision in light of this.

5. During the course of its consideration, the appeal applications were amended to omit the dormer window. I have therefore amended the description of development and works in my formal decisions to reflect this.

Main Issues

6. Whether the appeal development and works would preserve the special architectural or historic interest of Yew Tree Cottage, a grade II listed building and whether they would preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Crondall Conservation Area.

Reasons

7. The appeal site includes a compact, red brick, timber framed cottage with a prominent pitched roof. It comprises four bays which front the road and a rear bay which is at right angles to it, in the form of a cross wing. From the evidence before me and my site visit, it appears that the historic core of the appeal building is the central two bays that front onto the street, with later additions on either side. The cross wing at the rear is a later addition to the central core, at the side of which a large chimney stack rises, which has been lowered at some time. The listed building's plan form, with cross wing, and its additions and alteration over time provide an insight into its historic development. Its historic fabric, including its timber frame, red brick walls, prominent tiled roof, historic windows, materials and detailing all help define its special interest. All these matters contribute to the significance of Yew Tree Cottage as a listed building.
8. The listed building fronts onto the street, adjacent to other historic buildings. Its close relationship to the street and its neighbours contributes to its setting and its significance as a heritage asset.
9. Crondall Conservation Area comprises much of the historic village. It includes the village's medieval layout of narrow streets, lined with many historic buildings, mature trees and planting. Predominantly residential, it includes historic buildings, with some cohesion in terms of their domestic two storey scale, use of traditional plan forms, detailing and materials. The appeal site, its plan form, materials and detailing identified, significantly contribute to that character and appearance.
10. The proposed two storey extension would be small in relation to the main house. It would be narrower and lower than the main building, such that it would relate appropriately to it. It would follow the likely pattern of a traditional means of extension to its rear which would not appear out of place. It would include a pitched roof, would use traditional materials and detailing, such that it would blend in. Even though it would be sited adjacent to the rear cross wing, it would be significantly smaller in plan form, bulk and rearward projection, such that it would read as separate. That would help to inform the historic development of the appeal building. Whilst it would be very close to the prominent chimney stack which rises nearby, it would be significantly lower, such that it would still be expressed as a feature of the appeal building, particularly when viewed from the rear. Whilst the proposed roof form would abut the chimney stack nearby, subject to further details, that junction would not appear harmfully awkward and would generally relate to the complex of roof slope junctions seen at the rear of the listed building.

11. As the appeal development and works would relate appropriately to the listed building and retain its current relationship with its neighbours and the street, they would not materially affect its setting.
12. The appeal proposal would involve some intervention and loss of historic fabric. However, on the basis of the evidence before me, the interventions proposed would retain the most significant aspects of the timber frame. In concentrating interventions to the later and previously altered historic fabric, the proposed works and development generally retain the significance of the historic fabric and that of the listed building.
13. I have concluded that the appeal building positively contributes to the character and appearance of the Crondall Conservation Area. On the basis of my previous findings the appeal works and development would preserve the significance of Yew Tree Cottage. It follows therefore that they would preserve the character and appearance of the Crondall Conservation Area.
14. I conclude that the appeal development and works would preserve the special architectural or historic interest of Yew Tree Cottage, a grade II listed building and its setting and preserve the character and appearance of the Crondall Conservation Area. For this reason they would generally accord with Hart District Council Local Plan (Replacement) 1996-2006 and First Alterations to the Hart District Local Plan (Replacement) 1996-2006 Saved Policies CON 17 and CON 13. Those policies, together, aim to conserve and protect listed buildings from potentially harmful development and preserve or enhance the character or appearance of conservation areas. For the same reasons, it would also generally accord with section 12 of the National Planning Policy Framework (the Framework), which aims to conserve and enhance the historic environment.

Other Matter

15. I have noted that the proposed new bedroom is indicated as a store on the 'existing' appeal plans. However, on the basis of my findings on the main issues in this case, that matter does not affect my overall conclusions.

Planning Conditions

16. A list of suggested planning conditions is before me. I have agreed with the imposition of most of these subject to refinement to improve clarity and ensure consistency with national policy and guidance.¹ A list of planning conditions to be imposed is set out in Annex A and Annex B to my decisions.
17. Standard time and plans conditions are required to ensure clarity and in the interests of proper planning. Conditions to control external materials, brickwork, windows, joinery, the detail of the proposed roof and internal alterations and making good to the historic fabric of the listed building are necessary to ensure that the proposal blends into the Crondall Conservation Area and preserves the significance of the listed building.

¹ Paragraphs 203 and 206 of the Framework and PPG paragraphs 21a-001-034

Conclusions

18. For the above reasons, and taking all other matters raised into consideration, I conclude that both appeals should be allowed, subject to the planning conditions set out in Annex A and Annex B to my decisions.

R Barrett

INSPECTOR

Annex A

- 1) The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than three years from the date of this decision.
- 2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with approved plans: 2A.01 Rev A; 2A.03 Rev A; 3A.01 Rev C; 3A.02 Rev A.
- 3) No development shall take place until samples of all external facing materials have been submitted to and approved by the local planning authority in writing. The relevant works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved sample details.
- 4) No development shall take place until sample panels of all new facing brickwork showing the proposed bricks, face-bond and pointing mortar have been provided on site and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved sample panels.
- 5) No development shall take place until large scale construction details (at a minimum 1:20 scale) of the design of the roof for the extension are submitted to and agreed in writing by the local planning authority. Such details shall show the junction between the proposed roof and the nearest chimney stack, all verges, eaves, hips and ridges, valleys and associated elements. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- 6) No development shall take place until large scale construction details (at a minimum 1:20 scale) of all external windows are submitted to and agreed in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Annex B

- 1) The works hereby permitted shall begin not later than three years from the date of this decision.
- 2) The works hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with approved plans: 2A.01 Rev A; 2A.03 Rev A; 3A.01 Rev C; 3A.02 Rev A.
- 3) No works shall take place until details and samples of the materials to be used in the alterations to the listed building hereby permitted have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

- 4) All areas requiring amendment or making good of historic fabric in order to accommodate the works approved shall be executed so as to match the adjacent works, in terms of materials used and finished appearance.
- 5) No works shall take place until large scale construction details (at a minimum 1:20 scale) of the formation of the openings through the wall and floor elements of the existing building and the making good required are submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- 6) No works shall take place until large scale construction details (at a minimum 1:20 scale) of the new stairs and works to the existing stairs and the making good required are submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- 7) No works shall take place until large scale construction details (at a minimum 1:20 scale) of the new doors and joinery are submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

-----END OF CONDITIONS -----