



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 12 February 2019

by H Porter BA(Hons) MScDip IHBC

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 01 March 2019

Appeal Ref: APP/J1860/Y/18/3208200

Ivy Barn, Broadwas, Worcester, Worcestershire WR6 5NE

- The appeal is made under section 20 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 against a refusal to grant listed building consent.
 - The appeal is made by Mr David Cash against the decision of Malvern Hills District Council.
 - The application Ref 18/00223/LB, dated 7 February 2018, was refused by notice dated 27 April 2018.
 - The works proposed are 'install one Velux roof light (78 x 98cm) to facilitate ventilation and natural light to internal bathroom'.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is allowed and listed building consent is granted for 'install one Velux roof light (78 x 98cm) to facilitate ventilation and natural light to internal bathroom' at Ivy Barn, Broadwas, Worcester, Worcestershire WR6 5NE in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref 18/00223/LB, dated 7 February 2018, subject to the attached schedule of conditions.

Main Issue

2. The main issue is the effect of the proposed works on the special architectural and historic interest of the Grade II listed building.

Reasons

3. The appeal property comprises a part of an attached barn, historically ancillary to Ivy House Farmhouse (List Entry Number: 1302181) a Grade II listed, timber-framed 17th century farmhouse. Though not referred to in the listing description the appeal building evidently pre-dates 1 July 1948, being within the curtilage of Ivy House Farmhouse, and is covered by the same statutory protection.
4. Ivy Barn is a typical ancillary agricultural structure of simple, linear form, clad with blackened timber boards, under a clay tile roof and on a red brick plinth. Subsequent to listing, the appeal building and a number of ancillary agricultural structures within its grounds were subject to residential conversion, resulting in a number of original openings having been glazed, and new ones inserted, including at roof level. Nevertheless, as experienced today, the appeal building appears as a sensitively converted former farm building, the overall form of which continues to reflect its agricultural origins and historic connection with the Grade II listed Farmhouse.

5. The proposal is to insert an additional roof light into the barn's east elevation, between an extant rooflight and a protruding plastic flue, to provide natural light and improved ventilation to an upstairs bathroom. The proposed rooflight would be of similar form to the existing, albeit slightly smaller.
6. The proposed roof-light would alter a portion of the barn's roof slope that has already been subject to domestic alteration. The roof light would be visible, but its location between a larger existing rooflight and a protruding flue would be a modest intervention. It would not encroach into the unbroken line of tiled roof that runs above the existing roof-light, nor that on the other side of the central gable. Rather, the proposed roof-light would be a low-key alteration that would preserve the building's architectural interest, character, or agricultural origins and historic association with Ivy House Farmhouse.
7. I have had regard to the Historic England Best Practice Guidance 'Adapting Traditional Farm Buildings' and take the point that incremental contemporary additions can cumulatively have a negative impact on a building's character. However, in this instance, and taking into account the nature of the proposal and the site-specific context, I do not consider that the additional, smaller rooflight proposed would not have an intrusive, cluttering or cumulatively harmful impact.
8. As there are no alternative means of gaining natural light to the bathroom before me to consider, I have considered the appeal proposal on its own merits. While a conservation-type rooflight is usually preferable, taking into account the nature of existing rooflights on the appeal building and neighbouring buildings, the more standard 'Velux' type would appear in keeping. I note that, during negotiations with the Council at the time of the barn's conversion, rooflights were removed from the scheme, including on the building's east elevation. However, I do not know the size or precise location of them; moreover, my assessment of the proposal is against a building that has already been subject to conversion and in which the context has also evolved over time.
9. For these reasons, I consider that the proposed works would preserve the Grade II listed building and its features of special architectural or historic interest. I therefore find no conflict with the expectations of Section 16(2) or 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990; the design and historic environment policies SWDP 6 and SWDP 24 of the South Worcestershire Development Plan, 2016; or the historic environment policies within the National Planning Policy Framework, July 2018.

Conclusion and Conditions

10. For the reasons given above, I conclude that the appeal should be allowed. Conditions are required in respect of timescales for the works and compliance with the submitted plans, in the interests of clarity. I have also imposed a condition in respect of requiring details be submitted of the rooflight hereby approved. For precision, and to ensure details are at an appropriate scale and include details of making-good, I have amended the Council's suggested wording. This pre-commencement condition is necessary to ensure that the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building is preserved.

H Porter

INSPECTOR

SCHEDULE OF CONDITIONS

- 1) The works authorised by this consent shall begin no later than 3 years from the date of this consent.
- 2) The works hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Site Location; Proposed Site Roof Drawing.
- 3) Notwithstanding Condition 2, no works shall take place until full details of the rooflight hereby approved, including drawings to a minimum scale of 1:10 and including details of manufacturer, profile, materials and finish, and details of any making good, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The works shall then be carried out in accordance with the approved details and maintained thereafter.