



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 8 July 2019

by Mrs H Nicholls MSc MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 24 July 2019

Appeal Ref: APP/U1105/W/19/3225267

**Dunscombe Barn, Lane Past Dunscombe Manor Farm, Salcombe Regis
EX10 0PN**

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr T Johnson against the decision of East Devon District Council.
 - The application Ref 18/0346/FUL, dated 13 February 2018, was refused by notice dated 26 September 2018.
 - The development proposed is a replacement dwelling.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is allowed and planning permission is granted for proposed replacement dwelling at Dunscombe Barn, Lane Past Dunscombe Manor Farm, Salcombe Regis, EX10 0PN, in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref 18/0346/FUL, dated 13 February 2018, subject to the conditions in the attached schedule.

Main Issue

2. The main issue is the effect of the proposal on the setting of the Grade II listed building known as Dunscombe Cottage and on the wider rural landscape.

Reasons

3. Under Section 66(1) of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, I am required to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting.
4. The appeal site lies to the south of a listed building, Dunscombe Cottage. It is listed as a C16 example of a small cob thatched former farmhouse of one and two storeys with a later south wing. The principal elevation with a projecting gabled bay faces the road, Dunscombe Lane. From its listing description and from the evidence, I consider that the significance of the designated heritage asset relates primarily to the age, form and historic fabric of the building, particularly the original part, and the specified features of special interest.
5. Despite being in a rural landscape setting, the setting of Dunscombe Cottage is no longer characteristically agricultural, with both it and the curtilage of Dunscombe Barn having been domesticated through their subdivision from one another and through the addition of garages and other such alterations. Consequently, the significance of Dunscombe Cottage is no longer reliant on Dunscombe Barn to be appreciated as a former farmhouse in its own right.
6. Dunscombe Cottage and Dunscombe Barn have generously proportioned curtilages, both of which are surrounded by well-established trees and

vegetation. Consequently, there is limited visibility of Dunscombe Cottage from the curtilage of Dunscombe Barn and vice versa. From Dunscombe Lane, despite this being the main public viewpoint from where Dunscombe Cottage can be viewed, Dunscombe Barn is not visible. From the public right of way which serves as access to Dunscombe Barn, through the gateway only some of the uppermost parts and thatched roof of Dunscombe Cottage are visible. Consequently, there are very few public areas from where both properties and their historic association with one another can be viewed and interpreted.

7. The proposed dwelling would involve the demolition of Dunscombe Barn, which itself possesses very limited historic or architectural value. It is not a curtilage-listed building and bears little resemblance to a former barn, having been converted in such a way as to appear more domestic than traditional in its form and appearance.
8. The replacement dwelling would be a larger, two storey dwelling of contemporary design. It would have some sections of timber cladding and slate hanging, particularly on its principal elevation. Whilst it would be larger in scale than the existing dwelling, it would not be so large as to be out of scale relative to its curtilage, or be domineering in comparison to the scale or setting of Dunscombe Cottage. The alterations to the massing and form of the north elevation would be noticeable from Dunscombe Cottage and from areas within its curtilage, however, such views of a different dwelling would not alter the way in which the heritage asset would be experienced or enjoyed. The closest part of the northern elevation would be sited a further 6 metres away from the boundary shared with Dunscombe Cottage than the existing dwelling which helps to maximise the degree of separation and avoid the potential sense of enclosure from a larger dwelling close to the boundary.
9. The trees around the curtilage of Dunscombe Barn would be maintained, albeit with a degree of seasonal change, which would help to limit and soften public views of the replacement dwelling. The proposed dwelling, despite its increased scale, form and mass, would not be visually intrusive or harmful to the surrounding rural landscape. The public views of the dwelling that would be attainable would be of a well-designed dwelling in a well-proportioned landscaped setting, in a wider setting that includes a number of other dwellings and tourism accommodation facilities of varied age and design.
10. In view of this main issue, the proposal would not have a harmful effect on the setting of Dunscombe Cottage or on the wider rural landscape. The proposal therefore complies with Strategy 46 and Policy EN9 of the East Devon Local Plan 2013 – 2031, which, amongst other things, seek to preserve the significance of designated heritage assets and conserve and enhance the quality and local distinctiveness of the natural and historic landscape character.
11. As the proposal would preserve, and thus have a neutral effect on the heritage asset and its setting, the public benefits of the proposal do not need to be weighed in the balance as ordinarily required under paragraph 196 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2019).

Conditions

12. In addition to the statutory time limit condition, a condition requiring adherence to the specified plans is necessary in the interests of certainty. In the interests of the character and appearance of the area, it is also necessary

to impose a condition requiring details of the external materials to be used in the building to be submitted for approval by the Council prior to their use in the construction of the replacement dwelling.

Conclusion

13. For the above reasons, the appeal is allowed.

Hollie Nicholls

INSPECTOR

Schedule of Conditions

- 1) The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than 3 years from the date of this decision.
- 2) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Location Plan & TW13/071B.
- 3) No development above foundation level shall take place until a schedule of materials and finishes, and, where so required by the Local Planning Authority, samples of such materials and finishes, to be used for the external walls, windows, water goods and roofs of the proposed development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.