



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 1 October 2019

by J M Tweddle BSc(Hons) MSc MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 4th November 2019

Appeal Ref: APP/G2713/D/19/3233720

Well Barn, South Back Lane, Tollerton YO61 1PU

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Edward Harland against the decision of Hambleton District Council.
 - The application Ref 19/00694/FUL, dated 25 March 2019, was refused by notice dated 25 June 2019.
 - The development is described as a 'proposed extension to side of the existing dwelling'.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Procedural Matter

2. The proposal is described as a side extension. However, from the evidence before me, it is clear that the extension would project forward of the southwest facing elevation and as this contains the main architectural features, including the main entrance and primary windows, I am of the view that this forms the principal elevation of the dwelling. The proposal therefore amounts to a front extension and I have proceeded with the appeal on this basis.

Main Issue

3. The main issue in this appeal is the effect of the proposal on the character and appearance of the existing building and the surrounding area, with due regard to the location of the site in the Tollerton Conservation Area.

Reasons

4. Well Barn is a modest red brick building which is sited abutting and at a right angle to the adjacent lane. The lane and the appeal site are located on the southern fringe of the village of Tollerton, marking a transition between the extent of the village and the countryside beyond. The site lies within the Tollerton Conservation Area (CA) with its significance, in part, gained from its origins as a planned medieval settlement with development focused around its village green and along Main Street. The long narrow 'crofts' of land running between Main Street and South Back Lane are remnant of this medieval settlement pattern and provide a distinctive feature that accentuate the village's historical relationship with the surrounding countryside.
5. The Council has previously granted planning permission for the residential conversion, including extension, of the original barn. This permission, now implemented, has been carried out to a high standard with sympathetic alterations that have sought to ensure the former building's character and

appearance were retained and that the consequent effect upon the surrounding area was acceptable.

6. The converted building was formally a much smaller storage barn located at the end of a narrow croft and therefore likely to have been historically associated with one or more of the dwellings along Main Street. It is of a modest scale and simple linear form positioned within a relatively constrained narrow plot; such factors making a positive contribution to the intrinsic rural character and appearance of this part of the CA.
7. While there is no specific policy objection to the principle of a residential extension, I note that the appeal scheme would extend the building considerably. Due to its width and height, it would occupy a large area to the front of the existing building and result in the loss of the current single storey glazed link and timber framed entrance porch. In doing so, the proposal would diminish the simple rural character of the barn with its original scale, form and footprint indistinguishable from this latter addition. Indeed, the continuation of the ridge line upon the main extension would effectively re-orientate the appearance of the conversion, diminishing its original linear form and thereby undermining the character of the original structure.
8. Despite the use of sympathetic materials, appropriate architectural detailing and its set back from the road, the bulk of the proposal would be overly dominant and prominent, particularly when viewed from the lane adjacent to the site. Whilst reasonably localised, the effect of the proposal would be to diminish unacceptably the character, appearance and integrity of the existing building with consequent harm to the character and appearance of the Tollerton CA.
9. In terms of the National Planning Policy Framework (the Framework), the harm to the CA would be 'less than substantial' and it is therefore incumbent upon me to give considerable importance and weight to such harm. The Framework advises that this harm must be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal. The proposal would provide additional living accommodation for the appellant and his family, however, these are not public benefits. No other benefits have been advanced in support of the scheme. Accordingly, the harm to the CA is not outweighed by public benefits.
10. Consequently, I find that the proposal would have a significant harmful effect on the character and appearance of the existing building and the surrounding area. It follows, therefore, that the proposal would harm the character and appearance of the Tollerton Conservation Area. This is contrary to Policies CP16, CP17, DP28 and DP32 of the Hambleton Local Development Framework, which together seek to achieve high standards of design and the protection and enhancement of conservation areas. In this context, the proposal would also be contrary to the provisions of the Framework which seek to conserve and enhance the historic environment.

Other Matters

11. The appellant has drawn my attention to several other rural buildings along South Back Lane and in the surrounding area which have been subject to extension and alterations to varying degrees. However, I do not consider that the form, scale or design of these other properties provide any justification for

the appeal proposal which has instead been considered on its own individual merits.

12. I note the support from the local Parish Council and a neighbouring resident, however, this does not outweigh the harm I have found.

Conclusion

13. For the reasons I have set out, the appeal should be dismissed.

Jeff Tweddle

INSPECTOR