

Appeal Decisions

Site visit made on 29 October 2019

by John Braithwaite BSc(Arch) BArch(Hons) RIBA MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 7 November 2019

Appeal Ref: APP/T2350/W/19/3229833

23 Church Street, Clitheroe BB7 2DD

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr N Starkie against the decision of Ribble Valley Borough Council.
 - The application Ref 3/2019/0241, dated 13 March 2019, was refused by notice dated 3 May 2019
 - The development proposed is a domestic first floor extension above an existing garage to provide bedroom accommodation.
-

Appeal Ref: APP/T2350/Y/19/3229831

23 Church Street, Clitheroe BB7 2DD

- The appeal is made under section 20 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 against a refusal to grant listed building consent.
 - The appeal is made by Mr N Starkie against the decision of Ribble Valley Borough Council.
 - The application Ref 3/2019/0242, dated 13 March 2019, was refused by notice dated 3 May 2019.
 - The works proposed are a domestic first floor extension above an existing garage to provide bedroom accommodation.
-

Decisions

1. The appeals are dismissed.

Reasons

2. 23 Church Street is a two storey dwelling and is a Grade II listed building. It is attached to 21 Church Street, also a Grade II listed building with an east elevation onto Church Street, which is in commercial use. In front of the listed buildings, with access off Church Street through an ungated opening in a high stone boundary wall, is a parking area through which there is access to a garage at no. 23. To the north of the parking area, beyond a high stone boundary wall, is the churchyard of the Parish Church of St Mary Magdalene, a Grade I listed building. The listed buildings are located within the Clitheroe Conservation Area.

The main issues

3. The main issues are the effect of the proposed domestic first floor extension on; first, the architectural and historic interest of 23 Church Street; and second, the setting of the Parish Church of St Mary Magdalene and the character and appearance of the Clitheroe Conservation Area.

The first issue – the architectural and historic interest of 23 Church Street

4. 23 Church Street was first listed in 1950 and was, at that time, a two storey rear wing of 21 Church Street. Documentary evidence indicates that the listed building was extended some time after 1977 by the addition of a two storey wing and an attached garage. The wing is sympathetic in design and materials to the building as listed though it is slightly lower in height and lesser in scale. The garage also has a hipped slate roof.

5. The proposed extension would be above the garage, which would itself be slightly extended, and would extend first floor accommodation in the wing. The extension would match the wing in design, form and materials and, despite discrepancies between the east elevation and the roof plan as proposed on the application drawing, would have an appropriate roof form. The proposed extension is minor in scale and would extend a late 20th extension of the building as it was originally listed. The proposed development would not thus have any adverse effect on the architectural and historic interest of the listed building.

The second issue – the Church and the Conservation Area

6. There are glimpses of the wing and garage of 23 Church Street through the entrance off the street into the parking area. In these views the proposed extension, which would be set well back from the street, would not be prominent and, given its sympathetic design, would not be incongruous.

7. The Church is a prominent and distinctive feature of the Clitheroe Conservation Area. It makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the area, as does its surrounding churchyard, which is its immediate setting. The main entrance off Church Street into the churchyard is at the north-east corner of the parking area associated with nos. 21 and 23. A path leads from this entrance to a door into the church, in its south elevation, and then extends alongside this elevation. From this path there are views over the stone boundary wall of the churchyard of the north frontages of nos. 21 and 23.

8. The original elements of the listed buildings are set well back from the boundary wall and are not imposing. The later wing of no. 23 is closer to the boundary wall but it is only about 4.7 metres wide and lower than the original elements, so it is also not imposing. The garage does not rise above the boundary wall and cannot be seen from the churchyard. The proposed extension above the garage would be about 6.9 metres wide and would rise above the boundary wall by, up to eaves level, about two metres. Its north elevation would be blank and, given its length and proximity to the boundary wall, it would be a prominent and visually intrusive feature in views southwards from the path alongside the Church. The proposed extension would be a visually intrusive feature in, and would have an adverse effect on, the setting of the Church. The development would also harm, for this reason, the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

Conclusion

9. The proposed development would not have any adverse effect on the architectural and historic interest 23 Church Street. However, the proposed extension would have an adverse effect on the setting of the Parish Church of St Mary Magdalene and would also harm the character and appearance of the Clitheroe Conservation Area. The harm caused would be less than significant but, with regard to paragraph 196 of the National Planning Policy Framework, there are no public benefits to weigh against the harm that would be caused. The proposed

extension conflicts with Key Statement EN5 and policies DME4 and DMG1 of the Ribble Valley Core Strategy. Planning permission must therefore be withheld for a domestic first floor extension above an existing garage to provide bedroom accommodation at 23 Church Street, Clitheroe.

John Braithwaite

Inspector