



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 9 June 2020

by Alison Scott BA(Hons) DipTP MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 22 June 2020

Appeal Ref: APP/E2734/W/20/3246424

Car Sales Garage, Harrogate Road, Ferrensby HG5 0PZ

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Ms R Denton against the decision of Harrogate Borough Council.
 - The application Ref 19/02888/FUL, dated 25 June 2019, was refused by notice dated 30 August 2019.
 - The development proposed is 2no. new detached dwellings.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Procedural Matters

2. The description of the development has been amended by the Council and described as *Demolition of former car sales garage and erection of 2no. new detached garages and hard & soft landscaping*. The garage has since been demolished and the site cleared.
3. At the time the planning application was determined, the Harrogate District Local Plan 2014-2035 was progressing towards adoption. The Plan has now been adopted by the Council in March 2020 and is afforded full weight.

Main Issue

4. The main issue is the effect of the development on the character and appearance of the area.

Reasons

5. The appeal site is located to the north of the village of Ferrensby and has an open frontage to the A6055 Harrogate Road with only the concrete surface of the former use of the site present. The rear falls away towards the east boundary where another dwelling is partially visible above the perimeter hedgerow. Adjacent to the site is the small housing development, Willow Garth, of approximately four dwellings set back from the main road. These dwellings are well contained within their own development.
6. There are no objections from the Council to the principle of the redevelopment of the site for housing. However, it is the character and appearance of the dwellings in this location that is in contention by the parties.

7. To the opposite side of the road are agricultural fields and to the north side is grazing land with the built development on the east side of Harrogate Road commencing from the location of the appeal site. It is therefore a visually prominent site given it marks the beginning of the built fabric upon the approach into Ferrensby at this point.
8. Due to the split-level nature of the appeal site, the front of the proposed dwelling would take on similar characteristics to a bungalow development, but would be designed as two stories to the rear. Whilst it would be set back into the site, the proposed dwellings would front Harrogate Road and would be clearly visible within the street scene.
9. The scale and massing of the roof form and its proportions in comparison to the height of the ground floor, would create a bulky and imbalanced appearance to the dwellings. As the gable-to-front width proportions of the dwellings would be similar in width to one another, would result in them appearing squat. This would be further accentuated as they would occupy nearly the full width of the plot and by the close relationship of the two dwellings set side by side.
10. The projecting porch and its height would also introduce another design component into the scheme which would appear as a discordant feature to the dwellings, out of character with the area.
11. There is a variety of housing styles and ages within Ferrensby which I recognise. The appellant's Statement of Case and Design and Access Statement explains that they have been influenced by local vernacular as well as the design of the adjacent housing development at Willow Garth.
12. This is a small cluster of dwellings set in an irregular pattern, and is a stand-alone development of differing designs and styles. It is accessed from Harrogate Road by a single central vehicular access, and is in quite a secluded setting. None of these dwellings directly face onto Harrogate Road, nor is the design of this development comparable to that of the appeal site.
13. I notice that where houses along the A6055 are set back but front the main road, garages are located to the side of the dwelling and appear subservient. In this appeal location, the double garages would be positioned forward of the principal elevation of each dwelling, and sit close to the main road.
14. Given their proposed size, design and location, the garages would be a prominent feature here, and would have no subservience to the main dwellings. They would be seen above the existing perimeter boundary treatment on the approach into the village from the north and would appear as a dominant and incongruous feature that would be visually intrusive and harmful to the character and appearance of the area.
15. At Willow Garth, garages may sit forward of front elevations of the dwellings, however, this is representative of this design layout and cannot be compared to this appeal proposal.
16. Overall, the combination of proposed design solutions together with the position of the dwellings within the plot and the location of garages would result in a visually dominant and intrusive development that is not in character with the area.

17. The proposal is therefore in conflict with the Harrogate District Local Development Framework Core Strategy 2009 (CS) Policy SG4 for development to be well integrated within and complementary to the spatial qualities of the local area, amongst other criteria. It is also contrary to CS Policy EQ2 in its aims, as well as other criteria, to ensure new development incorporates high quality locally distinctive design.

Conclusion

18. The appeal is therefore dismissed.

Alison Scott

INSPECTOR