
Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 16 June 2020

by JP Longmuir BA (Hons) DipUD MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 3rd July 2020

Appeal Ref: APP/K1128/D/19/3242955

The Smithy, 61 Stoke Road, Noss Mayo, Devon PL8 1DX

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mrs Annie Glancy against the decision of South Hams District Council.
 - The application Ref 2326/19/HHO, dated 15 July 2019, was refused by notice dated 8 October 2019.
 - The development proposed is provision of garden room above existing boat store.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Main Issue

2. The effects on the character and appearance of the area which is within the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty.

Reasons

3. The site lies on the edge of Noss Mayo, within the South Devon Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB). The village is on a hillside overlooking Newton Creek, which is a narrowing inlet from the open sea a couple of miles away. A road runs around the periphery of the creek and provides a link with the neighbouring village Newtown Ferrers. The two sides of the creek are inter-visible. There are also notable views along the creek, not least of which is of Noss Mayo, fragmented by woodland over which its church tower provides a landmark feature.
4. The appeal site is at the eastern end of Noss Mayo by Bridgend and a quayside. The buildings here are tightly knit and narrowly follow the waterfront on a through road. The appeal site is at the seaward end of a cluster of buildings set amongst vegetation.
5. The appeal site is a boat store below the associated dwelling, accessed by stairs. It is on a slipway adjacent to the creek. The building is single storey with low pitch roof in muted materials.
6. The proposal would raise the roof and insert dormers to both sides, to create a garden room. Slate roofing and hanging tile are proposed, which I saw from my site visit are representative of the area.

7. The Council's decision notice expresses concern about the visual impacts arising from the alterations to the roof. The changes would result in a steeper roof pitch and expanse. The proportion of the roof to the walling would be substantially increased, which in my view would undermine the modest proportions of the building.
8. On the creek facing elevation a catslide dormer is proposed. Whilst this respects the plane of the roof, it draws attention and would accentuate the roofscape. On the landward (rear) facing elevation, a flat roofed dormer is proposed with full length glazing. Whilst this elevation directly faces the main dwelling, the altered roofline would be evident from the public domain. The changed roofline would give the building a top-heavy and unbalanced appearance, while its increased height, bulk and more complex roofline would give it undue presence in the street scene, such that it would no longer appear subservient to the host dwelling.
9. The boathouse is very prominent in the creek side views from the quayside at Noss Mayo and various points along the through road. The building would stand out and detract from the overall harmony of these views.
10. There is mention of other boathouses along the creek and it is suggested that there is no consistent vernacular. Whilst they do vary, I observed on my site visit that they tend to be more segregated from the associated dwelling which gives them more of their own context. I also noted that whilst some are contemporary, they are simple in form and detailing. Consequently, I do not feel that these other boathouses alter my conclusion on the appeal proposal.
11. I therefore conclude that the proposal would be harmful to the character and appearance of the area and would fail to conserve or enhance the landscape and scenic beauty of the AONB. Policies Dev20, Dev23, Dev24 and Dev25 of the Plymouth and South Devon Joint Local Plan (LP), 2014-2034, March 2019, seek to promote appropriate design and protect the landscape including the AONB. The Newtown and Noss Neighbourhood Plan 2017-2034 similarly seeks to promote design and protection of the landscape, particularly the waterfront. Paragraph 172 of the National Planning Policy Framework attaches great weight to the conservation of AONBs and paragraph 127 promotes quality design, whilst the National Design Guide, October 2019 provides detailed guidelines. The proposal would conflict with these policies and guidance.

Conclusion

12. I therefore conclude that the appeal should be dismissed.

John Longmuir

INSPECTOR