



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 15 June 2020

by J M Tweddle BSc(Hons) MSc(Dist) MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 7 July 2020

Appeal Ref: APP/M0933/D/20/3249923

3 Rose Hill Grove, Sandside, Milnthorpe, Cumbria LA7 7HR

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Peter Manville against the decision of South Lakeland District Council.
 - The undated application Ref SL/2020/0009 was refused by notice dated 12 March 2020.
 - The development proposed is described as 'total refurbishment including loft conversion, porch replacement, single storey extension and provision of new parking area'.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Procedural Matters

2. The Council does not raise any concerns with the proposed replacement porch, nor the creation of a parking area and new access to the public highway. My deliberations and decision are therefore confined to the proposed single storey side extension.
3. The appellant has presented me with several plans that illustrate options for alternative forms of development. However, these were not submitted to the LPA as formal revisions to the scheme. I am mindful that it is not the purpose of the appeal process to evolve a scheme and it is therefore important that what is considered by the Inspector is essentially what was considered by the LPA. I have therefore proceeded to determine the appeal on the plans which the LPA based its decision, as originally submitted and subsequently formally amended. Beyond this, I have not considered the merits of any alternative scheme.

Main Issue

4. The main issue is the effect of the proposal on the character and appearance of the host property and the surrounding area, with particular regard to the Arnside and Silverdale Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty.

Reasons

5. 3 Rose Hill Grove is a modest single storey bungalow located on a cul-de-sac within the small village of Sandside. The appeal site and the wider settlement lie within the Arnside and Silverdale Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (the AONB). The appeal property is typical of development in the surrounding area, the street scene of which is generally characterised by a mix of detached and semi-detached bungalows of a similar design to the appeal property. The majority of buildings have painted render finishes and traditional pitched roofs.

6. Both the National Planning Policy Framework (the Framework) and the Council's local planning policies require that great weight is given to conserving landscape and scenic beauty in AONBs. As such, the area is afforded the highest status of protection in these regards.
7. The proposal would introduce a sizable single storey side extension with a flat roof. The extension would be set back from the front elevation, extend beyond the rear elevation and include an overhanging flat roof feature. Despite a matching external finish, the proposal would introduce a prominent and discordant form of development that would be significantly at odds with the traditional appearance of the host property and surrounding buildings. The lack of fenestration and architectural detailing along the proposed northwest facing elevation would result in a large characterless elevation that would not be a positive addition to the street scene. In doing so, the proposal would also be harmful to the character and appearance of this part of the AONB.
8. While the newly planted beech hedging could reduce these harmful effects, the extension would still be visible in the street scene and from wider public viewpoints through this part of the AONB. Furthermore, landscaping ought to be used to complement good quality development not to conceal a poor form of development that fails to contribute positively to its surroundings.
9. For the above reasons, I find that the proposal would harm the character and appearance of the host property and the surrounding area including the AONB. This is contrary to policies CS8.2 and CS8.10 of the South Lakeland Local Development Framework Core Strategy 2010, policies DM1 and DM2 of the South Lakeland Local Plan Development Management Policies Development Plan Document 2019, policies AS01, AS02 and AS08 of the Arnside and Silverdale AONB Development Plan Document 2019 and the associated provisions for the Framework. Taken together, these policies seek to achieve the highest standards of sustainable design within the AONB, responding to the character of the landscape and distinctiveness of the local built environment.

Other Matters

10. My attention has been drawn to a handful of flat roofed extensions on nearby properties. I was able to see these examples during my visit. However, it was apparent to me that these other examples were of a smaller scale or less visually prominent than that of the appeal proposal. They are not therefore comparable and do not set any kind of precedent. In any case, I have considered the appeal on its own merits.
11. I note that the AONB Partnership did not raise concern with the form of the proposed extension. In addition, the appellant has suggested that the proposal would be built with high regard to modern sustainability principles incorporating solar panels, an airtight timber frame construction, a heat recovery and ventilation management system, etc. I also acknowledge the lack of objection from any neighbouring residents. However, these matters do not outweigh the harm I have found and do not therefore lead me away from my overall conclusion.

Conclusion

12. For the reasons I have set out, the appeal is dismissed.

J M Tweddle

INSPECTOR