



Appeal Decisions

Site visit made on 5 October 2020

by S Edwards MA MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 24 November 2020

Appeal A Ref: APP/H1705/W/20/3254585

Manor Farm House, Ashe Lane, North Oakley RG26 5TT

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr and Mrs Keogh against the decision of Basingstoke & Deane Borough Council.
 - The application Ref 20/00334/HSE, dated 5 February 2020, was refused by notice dated 22 April 2020.
 - The development proposed is 'conversion of part first floor to form additional bedroom and bathroom to annexe accommodation, involving construction of new dormer window and rooflights. Various internal alterations'.
-

Appeal B Ref: APP/H1705/Y/20/3254587

Manor Farm House, Ashe Lane, North Oakley RG26 5TT

- The appeal is made under section 20 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 against a refusal to grant listed building consent.
 - The appeal is made by Mr and Mrs Keogh against the decision of Basingstoke & Deane Borough Council.
 - The application Ref 20/00335/LBC, dated 5 February 2020, was refused by notice dated 22 April 2020.
 - The works proposed are 'conversion of part first floor to form additional bedroom and bathroom to annexe accommodation, involving construction of new dormer window and rooflights. Various internal alterations'.
-

Decisions

Appeal A

1. Appeal A is allowed, and planning permission is granted for 'conversion of part first floor to form additional bedroom and bathroom to annexe accommodation, involving construction of new dormer window and rooflights. Various internal alterations' at Manor Farm House, Ashe Lane, North Oakley RG26 5TT, in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref 20/00334/HSE, dated 5 February 2020, and the plans submitted with it, subject to the attached Schedule of conditions.

Appeal B

2. Appeal B is allowed, and listed building consent is granted for 'conversion of part first floor to form additional bedroom and bathroom to annexe accommodation, involving construction of new dormer window and rooflights. Various internal alterations' at Manor Farm House, Ashe Lane, North Oakley RG26 5TT, in accordance with the terms of the application Ref 20/00335/LBC, dated 5 February 2020, and the plans submitted with it, subject to the attached Schedule of conditions.

Preliminary Matters

3. Both appeals relate to the same site and raise similar issues, and I shall therefore consider them in a single document, in the interests of brevity.
4. The descriptions of the proposed development and works have been amended in subsequent documents. I have adopted the descriptions included within the decision notices, which accurately reflect the proposed development and works before me.
5. The stable block subject to this appeal is classified as a curtilage listed building under Section 1(5) (b) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (the Act), and as such is treated as part of the Grade II listed farmhouse. I have therefore had special regard to sections 16(2) and 66(1) of the Act.

Main Issue

6. For both appeals, the main issue is whether the proposed development and works would preserve the significance of the curtilage listed stable block, but also the Grade II listed buildings known as Manor Farmhouse (the farmhouse) and Barn about 50 metres East of Manor Farmhouse (the barn), as derived notably from their setting.

Reasons

7. Manor Farmhouse is a Grade II listed property dating from the early 18th century, which is set in a generally rural location, with a secluded access off Ashe Lane. The proposed development and works relate to a stable block situated between the farmhouse and a Grade II listed barn, which also dates from the early 18th century. The stable block is a structure characterised by its horizontal emphasis and simple detailing, which was constructed as a functional outbuilding associated with the farmhouse during the 18th century. Whilst it was extended subsequently in the 19th century, the stable block retains a subservient relationship to the main property.
8. The farmhouse stands out as a building of some status which is complemented by a number of structures clearly constructed for an agricultural purpose, including the appeal building. The significance of these designated heritage assets derives primarily from their architectural and historic interest, as a typical farmstead characterised by its loose courtyard plan of detached buildings. This is illustrated by the group value which the listed buildings hold collectively, together with the stable block.
9. Although the stable block may not have been considered worthy of being listed in its own right, it is nevertheless listed by virtue of being within the setting of the Manor Farmhouse. As such, the preservation of this curtilage listed building carries the same considerable importance and weight, and contribution to significance, either in its own right or as part of the listed group.
10. The stable block has been subject to significant alterations in the past, which have eroded its original character as an agricultural building, thus giving it a more domestic appearance, notably through the introduction of dormer windows and rooflights. That said, its characteristic form, detailing and layout as an agricultural structure subservient to the farmhouse are still legible.

11. The appeal scheme would primarily comprise of works to the first floor level of the stable block, which is currently used as ancillary accommodation to the main dwelling and for storage purposes. The proposed development and works include a number of alterations to the building's roof structure, which is of timber-frame construction. Some of the existing trusses are proposed to be trimmed to facilitate the use of the first floor level and new partitions would be installed to create the bedrooms and bathrooms. Nevertheless, the trusses would remain exposed, thus allowing the roof structure to still be appreciated.
12. The front (south) elevation of the building includes three dormer windows, but also four modern rooflights, which presently detract from the historic character of the building. As part of the appeal scheme, these openings would be replaced with conservation rooflights, which would be larger in size, thus requiring small sections of common rafter below the existing rooflight apertures to be removed. However, the proposed rooflights, by reason of their detailed design, would be more sympathetic to the historic character and appearance of the building.
13. The proposed dormer window, which would require sections of historic rafters to be cut and removed, would be of a similar size and design to the existing dormers in the western end of the stable block. The Council considers that the dormer would represent the intrusion of a prominent domestic feature into the part of the building which retains much of its agricultural character. I disagree. The proposed addition would sit alongside another dormer. Furthermore, there is another opening within the eastern section of the stable block, in addition to the modern rooflights which are peppered around the northern and southern planes. Despite their domestic appearance, the new features would, in that particular context, remain modest in scale and the effect of the proposed development and works on the significance of the appeal building would not be harmful.
14. No concerns were raised by the Council regarding the insertion of garage doors in the open-sided part of the garage block, and I find no reasons to take a different view, particularly as they would hide the cars and domestic paraphernalia stored in that part of the building.
15. Overall, I am therefore satisfied that the proposal would not further erode the agricultural character of the stable block or cause harm to its significance. Accordingly, the appeal scheme would also preserve the special architectural or historic interest of the Grade II listed farmhouse and barn, as well as their respective settings. The proposed development and works would therefore accord with Policy EM11 of the Basingstoke and Deane Local Plan 2011-2029¹, which notably seeks to ensure that all development proposals conserve or enhance the quality of the borough's heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance. For the same reasons, I find no conflict with section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (the Framework), which requires new developments to conserve and enhance the historic environment.

Other Matters

16. The appeal site lies within the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB). Paragraph 172 of the Framework states that AONBs have the highest status of protection in relation to landscape and scenic

¹ Adopted May 2016.

beauty, and that great weight should be given to their conservation. No concerns have been raised by the Council in that particular regard and there are no reasons for me to disagree with this approach. I am therefore satisfied that the proposal would preserve the landscape and scenic beauty of the AONB.

17. The appellants have notably sought to justify the proposed development and works by reason of the needs associated with the personal circumstances of their granddaughter and their groundman. However, in the light of my findings above, this is not a matter on which this appeal turns.

Conditions

18. I have considered the conditions suggested by the Council, making minor amendments where necessary, to ensure compliance with the tests as set out within paragraph 55 of the Framework and the National Planning Practice Guidance². The appellant has confirmed his agreement to pre-commencement conditions.
19. In addition to the standard time limit, I shall impose conditions specifying the relevant drawings which the development and works must accord with, in the interests of certainty and to provide clarity. Conditions regarding external materials, detailing and services are required to preserve the architectural and historic interest of the curtilage listed building, but also the respective settings of the Grade II listed farmhouse and barn.
20. I shall also impose a condition to ensure that the appeal premises are only used for incidental purposes to the main residential use of the farmhouse. A condition requiring the implementation of measures detailed within the Bat Emergence Surveys & Mitigation Strategy is considered necessary in the interests of biodiversity, but only in respect of Appeal A, as this is a matter which can be properly controlled as part of the planning permission.

Conclusions

21. For the reasons detailed above, and having regard to all other matters raised, I conclude that both appeals should be allowed.

S Edwards

INSPECTOR

SCHEDULE OF CONDITIONS

List of conditions for Appeal A Ref: APP/H1705/W/20/3254585

- 1) The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than 3 years from the date of this decision.
- 2) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Site location and Block plans (drawing no. A-19704.0.01, Rev.A, received 05.02.2020), Proposed family room conversion to form additional bedroom to annexe - Proposed Plans and

² Paragraph: 003 Reference ID: 21a-003-20190723.

Elevations (drawing no. A-19704.02.01 Rev.F, received 05.02.2020), Structural Engineer's notes and sketches, Modulus Structural Engineers, (received 05.02.2020).

- 3) The residential annexe hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes incidental to the residential use of the dwelling known as Manor Farm House.
- 4) No development shall commence on site until details of materials and finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing. The submitted details should include samples, including on-site sample panels as applicable. The development shall then proceed in strict accordance with the approved submission. These requirements include provision of information relating to:
 - The material, size, texture, colour, camber, and source of slate and tiles;
 - The material, colour, finish, size, profile and gauge of timber boarding;
 - The nature of insulation and membranes employed;
 - Materials and finishes to be used in the detailing of valleys, hips, ridges, gables, parapets, eaves and verges;

Notwithstanding approval of such information, all works of making good to the curtilage listed building shall be undertaken using materials and finishes, workmanship and detailing to match that of the existing building.

- 5) No development shall commence on site until full working details of all new and modified dormers, rooflights, windows and internal and external doors to be incorporated in the scheme have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Details shall include annotated elevations, sections and plans which are referenced to the approved plans. These details shall illustrate the nature of materials and finishes, framing members, glazing, glazing units, glazing bars, means of achieving background ventilation, and methods of opening. They shall also include details of modifications to existing openings and shall clearly show the nature and relationship of new and retained/modified elements of construction. Details shall be at a minimum scale of 1:20 and 1:5. The development shall be carried out and thereafter maintained in accordance with the details so approved.
- 6) All works relating to the scheme hereby approved shall be carried out in strict adherence with procedures and recommendations contained within Chapter 5 Mitigation, Compensation and Enhancements of the Bats Emergence Surveys and Mitigation Strategy by Species Ecological Consultancy dated December 2019.

List of conditions for Appeal B Ref: APP/H1705/Y/20/3254587

- 1) The works authorised by this consent shall begin not later than 3 years from the date of this consent.
- 2) The works hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Site location and Block plans (drawing no. A-19704.0.01, Rev.A, received 05.02.2020), Proposed family room

conversion to form additional bedroom to annexe - Proposed Plans and Elevations (drawing no. A-19704.02.01 Rev.F, received 05.02.2020), Structural Engineer's notes and sketches, Modulus Structural Engineers, (received 05.02.2020).

- 3) No related works shall commence on site until details of materials and finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing. The submitted details should include samples, including on-site sample panels as applicable. The works shall then proceed in strict accordance with the approved submission. These requirements include provision of information relating to:

- The material, size, texture, colour, camber, and source of slate and tiles;
- The material, colour, finish, size, profile and gauge of timber boarding;
- The nature of insulation and membranes employed;
- Materials and finishes to be used in the detailing of valleys, hips, ridges, gables, parapets, eaves and verges;

Notwithstanding approval of such information, all works of making good to the curtilage listed building shall be undertaken using materials and finishes, workmanship and detailing to match that of the existing building.

- 4) Notwithstanding the information shown on drawings, no related works shall commence on site until details of the position and type of installation of all new services internal and external to the building, including details of the impact of such services on the existing fabric have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The information to be submitted shall include information on wiring, cabling, water supply and drainage pipework, and heating systems including central heating using radiators and underfloor heating, flues, extract vent terminals, meter boxes, and external lighting. All work relating to services shall be undertaken strictly in accordance with the approved submission.
- 5) No related works shall commence on site until full working details of all new and modified dormers, rooflights, windows and internal and external doors to be incorporated in the scheme have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Details shall include annotated elevations, sections and plans which are referenced to the approved plans. These details shall illustrate the nature of materials and finishes, framing members, glazing, glazing units, glazing bars, means of achieving background ventilation, and methods of opening. They shall also include details of modifications to existing openings and shall clearly show the nature and relationship of new and retained/modified elements of construction. Details shall be at a minimum scale of 1:20 and 1:5. The works shall be carried out and thereafter maintained in accordance with the details so approved.

END OF SCHEDULE