
Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 18 January 2021

by John Wilde CEng MICE

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 09 February 2021

Appeal Ref: APP/D0840/W/20/3260884

Land south east of The Old Chapel, Carleen, Breage, Helston, Cornwall TR13 9qr

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant consent, agreement or approval to details required by a condition of a planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Longstone Ltd against the decision of Cornwall Council.
 - The application Ref PA20/04449, dated 31 May 2020, sought approval of details pursuant to condition No 1 of planning permission Ref pa17/06804, granted on 27 September 2017.
 - The application was refused by notice dated 14 September 2020.
 - The development proposed is the erection of up to three dwellings.
 - The details for which approval is sought are: Access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is allowed and the reserved matters are approved, namely access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale, details submitted in pursuance of condition No 1 attached to planning permission Ref PA17/06804 dated 27 September 2017.

Main Issue

2. The main issue is whether or not the proposed development would conserve or enhance the character or appearance of the World Heritage Site.

Reasons

3. The appeal site lies at the southern end of the village of Carleen, at a junction of two minor lanes and below an old converted Methodist chapel. The chapel is not listed but has some historical significance. Carleen lies within area 3 (Tregonning and Gwinear Mining Districts with Trewavas) of the Cornish Mining World Heritage site (WHS).
4. Outline permission was granted in 2017 for up to three dwellings. The proposal before me is for two, two storey dwellings. They would be located at the bottom of the site, at the furthest point from the old chapel. There would be existing and additional landscaping to both the south-east and south-west boundaries of the site. Due to the topography and road layout the only prolonged views of the proposed dwellings would be from the road to the south, as people enter the village.

5. From this direction the upper storey of the dwellings would be seen above the boundary planting. From a distance the proposed dwellings would be seen to the right of, and below, the old chapel. As observers approach the village, due to the bend in the road, the proposed dwellings would become more discernible and would partially obscure the lower portion of the chapel. However, due to its height and mass the chapel would still be seen as the dominant feature.
6. I acknowledge that the chapel has some historical significance and that some of that significance derives from it being part of an institution that played an important role in society at the time when mining was at its peak. However, the chapel is not listed and has already been converted, such that it has already lost some of its significance. Moreover, such chapels are not particularly rare and the proposed development would only partially obscure the elevation of the chapel from one direction.
7. The existing properties within the village comprise a mixed palette of materials including stone, render, slate and tiles. There is also a mixture of design types, ranging from bungalows to two storey dwellings, the chapel itself and the relatively modern village hall, the latter being the first built form encountered as you approach the village from the south. There is a modern bungalow in close proximity to the chapel and a modern rendered two storey property beyond this. Whilst roof shapes generally feature gable ends there are several examples of hipped roofs, including the four pairs of semi-detached houses in Tregonning Terrace and the chapel itself, which features a half hipped roof.
8. The proposed dwellings would have hipped roofs finished in slate which would serve to reduce the mass and bulk of the dwellings. The elevations would be constructed in white painted render with pewter coloured horizontal cladding. I acknowledge that the cladding is not particularly representative of the village but it is not unknown within the area. It would be recessive and would weather with time. I do not consider that its presence would be so noticeable or out of keeping such that it should represent a reason for dismissing the appeal. Both the roof shape and the finish of the elevations would help to reduce the visual impact of the proposed dwellings in relation to the chapel.
9. Taking into account the above, I consider that the proposed development would not detrimentally impact upon the integrity of the Outstanding Universal Value of the WHS. Consequently the character and appearance of the WHS would be conserved.
10. It follows that there would be no conflict with policies 2, 12 or 24 of the Cornwall Local Plan. Policy 2 requires that proposals should maintain and respect the special character of Cornwall. Policy 12 requires, amongst other things, that development must ensure Cornwall's enduring distinctiveness while policy 24 makes clear that development proposals will be permitted where they conserve, and where appropriate enhance, the significance of designated and non-designated assets and their settings.

Conclusion

11. For the above reasons, and having taken into account all other matters raised, the proposal accords with the development plan taken as a whole. I therefore conclude that the appeal should be allowed.

John Wilde INSPECTOR