
Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 21 November 2022

by David Reed BSc DipTP DMS MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 19 December 2022

Appeal Ref: APP/R3650/W/22/3301852

Land at Edgecombe, 10 Hill Road, Haslemere GU27 2JN

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr M Longford against the decision of Waverley Borough Council.
 - The application Ref WA/2020/2062, dated 3 November 2020, was refused by notice dated 26 May 2022.
 - The development proposed is the erection of a dwelling together with a new vehicular access off Hill Road and associated works.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is allowed and permission is granted for the erection of a dwelling together with a new vehicular access off Hill Road and associated works on Land at Edgecombe, 10 Hill Road, Haslemere GU27 2JN, in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref WA/2020/2062, dated 3 November 2020, subject to the attached schedule of conditions.

Application for costs

2. An application for costs was made by Mr M Longford against Waverley Borough Council. This application is the subject of a separate Decision.

Main Issue

3. The main issue is whether the contemporary style of the dwelling would be acceptable having regard to the character and appearance of the area.

Reasons

Architectural style

4. The proposal is for a large three-storey detached dwelling within the extensive curtilage of Edgecombe, itself a substantial detached house within the Half Moon Estate, a well-established residential area to the south of the town centre. There is no dispute that the site is suitable for an additional dwelling, with planning permission granted for a large house on 16 September 2019¹. The appeal proposal constitutes an amended design for the site and adopts a highly contemporary style in contrast to the previous traditional design.
5. The Haslemere Design Statement adopted in 2012 states that the Half Moon Estate was built about 1906 and that the 'houses, both detached and semi-detached, have strong architectural features such as turrets, pebbledash

¹ Reference WA/2019/0282

elevations, large chimneys and the discreet use of tile hanging. It should be considered for conservation area listing'. However, this has not happened to date, so the area has not been identified as having special architectural or historic interest and the legislative duty to consider whether the character and appearance of the area is preserved or enhanced does not apply.

6. The estate was laid out and many individual houses designed by the Arts and Crafts architect Herbert Hutchinson on garden village principles with a spacious road layout using vernacular styles and traditional materials. However, the estate has been subject to much later infilling, and whilst most properties have traditional designs and the estate still reflects its Arts and Crafts origins, the Council accepts that some contemporary architecture exists, albeit primarily domestic extensions. The appellant points to the extension at Greenways, at the eastern end of Hill Road, as a prime example².
7. The appeal proposal is for a contemporary, flat roof design of three storeys built into the steeply sloping site. The diminishing layers of accommodation provide for a basement with rear facing bedrooms, ground floor living space with rear terrace and a small first floor with lounge/study and further terrace. The result would be a stepped, low profile building with its roof significantly lower than the ridge of the host property Edgecombe. Facing towards Hill Road but set well into the site and on lower ground, the building would be visible from the front but not intrusive and with the retention of the thick hedgerow along College Hill views of the building would be limited from that direction.
8. The building has been carefully designed over a lengthy period of negotiation with council officers. Whilst occupying much of the plot, the building includes extensive outdoor terraces. The access from Hill Road would avoid the loss of thick hedgerow on College Hill which was involved in the previous proposal. Consistent with the design concept, the building would incorporate extensive glazing and high-quality materials including stone and timber cladding and a 'living' wall on the eastern side. At the same time the set-back and sunken nature of the building with a retaining wall and tree planting would provide for a satisfactory visual relationship with Edgecombe.
9. Taking these considerations together, whilst an individual contemporary style dwelling within a traditionally designed estate, the building would be politely discreet rather than a jarring, arrogant presence in its setting. Paragraph 3.32 of the Haslemere Neighbourhood Plan 2021 welcomes contemporary designs of a high standard which add interest and character to the street scene and that would be the case here.
10. For these reasons, whilst the proposal would undoubtedly be a deviation from the local vernacular on the Half Moon Estate, the contemporary style of the dwelling would be acceptable having regard to the character and appearance of the area. The proposal would comply with Policies H5 and H6 of the Haslemere Neighbourhood Plan as the addition of a further detached dwelling in a good-sized plot would reflect the character of existing development in the area and the contemporary style would represent a positive response to the relevant section of the Haslemere Design Statement. It would also comply with Policy TD1 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan Part 1 2018 and retained Policies D1 and D4 of the Local Plan 2002 which require high quality design that protects local character and complements its surroundings.

² Reference WA/2017/1849

Other matters

11. The first-floor terrace would face north towards Hollydene and No 14 College Hill but would be over 30 m away and with intervening vegetation, thus not unduly reducing privacy. The highway authority raise no objection to the proposed access and its relationship to the Hill Road/College Hill junction. Seen from the north, the dwelling would appear low profile and retain the greenery of the site, thus protecting the wooded appearance of the hillside when seen from the Haslemere Conservation Area. The new building would not significantly reduce sunlight to neighbouring properties and any additional noise and light generated by the occupiers would be no more than could reasonably be expected in a residential area.
12. The site lies within 5 km of the Wealden Heaths II Special Protection Area (SPA) where residential development may lead to additional recreational pressure and as a result adverse effects on the habitats concerned. However, Natural England have advised that where less than 20 dwellings are involved these are unlikely to have significant effects on the SPA. Accordingly, no appropriate assessment or mitigation is required in this case.
13. The Council has put forward several conditions should the appeal be allowed, and these have been assessed against the relevant tests with minor changes made as necessary. In addition to the standard implementation time limit it is necessary to define the plans which have been approved in the interests of certainty. Further conditions are necessary to control the external materials to be used, also to provide landscaping and means of enclosure together with their maintenance to ensure the satisfactory appearance of the development. Conditions to secure a vehicle charging point and to reduce water use are necessary in the interests of sustainability, to safeguard the nearby strategic water main to protect important local infrastructure and to provide vehicular access, visibility splays and car parking/turning facilities in the interests of highway safety. Use of the annexe should be restricted to avoid independent use. Finally, permitted development rights should be withdrawn to control any enlargement or alteration of the dwelling given the physical constraints of the site and to control the use and appearance of the flat roof area to protect the amenity of nearby residents.

Conclusion

14. The proposal would provide an additional high quality dwelling to help meet the wide variety of housing needs in the town and, since the contemporary style of the development would be acceptable having regard to the character and appearance of the area, there is no reason to withhold permission.
15. Having regard to the above the appeal should be allowed.

David Reed

INSPECTOR

Schedule of conditions

- 1) The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this decision.
- 2) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans listed below:
 - A.04 - Proposed Block Plan - received 5th April 2022
 - A.05 - Proposed Basement Floor Plan - received 5th April 2022
 - A.06 - Proposed Ground Floor Plan - received 5th April 2022
 - A.07 - Proposed First Floor Plan - received 5th April 2022
 - A.08 - Proposed Roof Plan - received 5th April 2022
 - A.09 - Proposed East and South Elevations - received 5th April 2022
 - A.10 - Proposed West and North Elevations - received 5th April 2022
 - A.11 - Proposed Site Plan - received 5th April 2022
 - A.12 - Proposed Street Scenes - received 5th April 2022
 - A.13 - Proposed Street Scene - received 5th April 2022
 - A.14 - Proposed Section - received 5th April 2022
 - 19028-002 - Proposed Access - received 12th February 2021No material variation from these plans shall take place unless prior approval has been given in writing by the local planning authority.
- 3) No above ground development associated with the dwelling hereby permitted shall commence until details and samples of the materials to be used in the external elevations have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out and thereafter retained in accordance with the approved details unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority.
- 4) No above ground development associated with the dwelling hereby permitted shall commence until a detailed landscaping scheme has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority which specifies species, planting sizes, spaces and numbers of trees, shrubs and hedges to be planted. All landscaping shall be carried out in accordance with the approved scheme in the first planting season (November-March) following the completion of the development and maintained thereafter. Any retained or newly planted trees, shrubs or hedges which die, become seriously damaged or diseased or are removed or destroyed within a period of 5 years from the date of planting shall be replaced during the next planting season with specimens of the same size and species unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority.
- 5) No above ground development associated with the dwelling hereby permitted shall commence until details of all screen and boundary walls, fences, hedges and any other means of enclosure have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The means of enclosure shall be implemented fully in accordance with the approved details prior to the occupation of any part of the development and thereafter maintained to the height and position as approved unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority. Any hedges and planting which die or become seriously damaged or diseased within a period of 5 years from the completion of the development shall be replaced during the next planting

season with specimens of the same size and species unless the local planning authority gives written consent to any variation.

- 6) Prior to the commencement of any above ground works in connection with the dwelling hereby permitted, written evidence shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority demonstrating that the dwelling will achieve a maximum water use of no more than 110 litres per person per day as defined in paragraph 36(2b) of the Building Regulations 2010 (as amended), measured in accordance with the methodology set out in Approved Document G (2015 edition). Such evidence shall be in the form of a Design Stage water efficiency calculator. Development shall be carried out wholly in accordance with the agreed details and maintained as such in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority.
- 7) Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification) no building, structure or other addition or alteration permitted by Classes A, AA and B of Part 1 of Schedule 2 of that Order shall be erected or constructed on the application site without the submission and approval of a further planning application made for that purpose.
- 8) Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 and Schedule 2, Part 1 and Classes A, B and C of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) (or any orders amending or re-enacting that Order with or without modification), the flat roof area of the dwelling hereby approved (other than the terraces indicated on the approved plans) shall not be used as a balcony, roof terrace, sitting out area or similar amenity area nor shall any railings or other means of enclosure be erected on top of or attached to the side of the dwelling without the grant of a further specific planning permission by the local planning authority.
- 9) The annexe within the dwelling hereby permitted shall only be used for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the dwelling and shall not be used as an independent residential unit.
- 10) No development shall take place within 5m of the nearby strategic water main unless and until information detailing how the developer intends to divert the asset/align the development, so as to prevent the potential for damage to subsurface potable water infrastructure, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Development shall be undertaken in accordance with the approved details. Unrestricted access shall be available at all times for the maintenance and repair of the asset during and after development.
- 11) No piling shall take place within 15m of the nearby strategic water main unless and until a piling method statement (detailing the depth and type of piling to be undertaken and the methodology by which such piling will be carried out, including measures to prevent and minimise the potential for damage to subsurface water infrastructure, and the programme for the works) has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Development shall be undertaken in accordance with the approved details.

- 12) No vehicle shall access the site unless and until the vehicular access hereby approved has been constructed and provided with visibility splays in accordance with the approved plans (Drawing No. 19028-002). Thereafter the visibility splays shall be kept permanently clear of any obstruction over 1m high.
- 13) The development hereby permitted shall not be first occupied unless and until space has been laid out within the site in accordance with the approved plans (Drawing No. A.04) for vehicles to be parked and for vehicles to turn so that they may enter and leave the site in forward gear. Thereafter the parking and turning areas shall be retained and maintained for their designated purpose.
- 14) The development hereby permitted shall not be first occupied unless and until the dwelling is provided with a fast-charge electric vehicle charging point (current minimum requirements - 7 kw Mode 3 with Type 2 connector - 230v AC 32 Amp single phase dedicated supply) in accordance with a scheme to be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority and shall thereafter be retained and maintained in working order.