



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 17 January 2023

by C Rose BA (Hons) BTP MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 30th January 2023

Appeal Ref: APP/P1133/W/22/3307427

Castle Inn, 18 Fordens Lane, Holcombe, Devon EX7 0LF

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Steven Hurdman against the decision of Teignbridge District Council.
 - The application Ref 22/01218/FUL, dated 16 June 2022, was refused by notice dated 25 August 2022.
 - The development proposed is construction of a garage in the existing carpark.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is allowed and planning permission is granted for construction of a garage in the existing carpark at Castle Inn, 18 Fordens Lane, Holcombe, Devon EX7 0LF in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref 22/01218/FUL, dated 16 June 2022, and the plans submitted with it, and subject to the schedule of conditions below.

Preliminary Matter

2. As the proposal relates to the setting of listed buildings, I have had special regard to section 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (the Act).

Main Issues

3. The main issues are the effect of the proposal on the character and appearance of the Holcombe Conservation Area (CA), and whether the proposal would preserve the settings of Grade II listed buildings (The Thatches, No's 5, 7, 9 and St Bernard's, Holcombe Road).

Reasons

Conservation Area

4. The appeal site is a car park associated with the Castle Inn Public House that is located on the opposite side of Fordens Lane. The boundary of the car park with Holcombe Road is formed from a hedgerow that screens the car park from the road. The hedge extends along the southern boundary of the site screening the car park from the access and properties to its south. The boundary with No 31 Fordens Lane is formed by block walling that screens the car park from the garden to No 31. The site has an open frontage facing the Castle Inn Public House providing access to the car park.
5. The CA covers two separate areas, Holcombe Village and Holcombe Coastal. The appeal proposal adjoins the boundary of the Holcombe Village CA that runs

along the site's frontage with Holcombe Road and Fordens Lane. This part of the CA area encompasses the main body of the historic settlement. The significance of the CA is derived from its dispersed linear form along the narrow main Holcombe Road comprising a series of similar sized rectangular plots with a sharp change in levels and buildings using historic and quality materials. This creates an intricate and varied local streetscene, to which the appeal site makes a neutral contribution.

6. The appeal proposal would retain the existing car parking area and the boundary features. The single-storey garage is proposed to be located at the lower end of the car park and in the corner of the appeal site furthest from the boundary to the CA. The garage would be a modest structure, set back from the road frontage and would use render and slate materials on a low-pitched roof. When viewed from the car park and its entrance it would be seen along with more modern buildings and, it would not be at odds with the existing built form. When viewed from Holcombe Road, whilst appearing at a slightly higher level, the garage would be barely visible above the boundary hedge. Moreover, such views would be limited to the junction of Holcombe Road with the access immediately to the south of the car park, and from the access itself. From these locations the garage would not appear prominent, intrusive or incongruous. The garage would not be visible from elsewhere on Holcombe Road or the wider CA.
7. Given the above, I conclude that the proposal would not harm the character and appearance of the Holcombe Conservation Area. As a result, it would comply with Policies EN5, S1 and S2 of the Teignbridge Local Plan 2013-2033 (LP) which, amongst other things, require that development respect the historic environment, respond positively to historic features, settings and street patterns, maintain the historic interest of assets, and be of a high quality design that responds to the characteristics of the site.

Setting of listed buildings

8. The Thatches, a Grade II listed building is the closest listed building to the appeal site. This two-storey cob and thatch building was originally two cottages with features including casement windows, rustic porch and baking oven projection and chimney.
9. The Thatches is positioned to the south-west of the appeal site at a much lower level. Whilst the end elevation of the listed building faces towards the appeal site, its primary front elevation faces south-east onto Holcombe Lane and relates in the main to the other cottages framing this thoroughfare. In light of this, I find the setting of The Thatches to be primarily associated with its immediate garden and its relationship with the historic Holcombe Road to its south.
10. The appeal proposal would be barely visible from only a small section of Holcombe Road due to the intervening boundary hedge. The garage is proposed to be set back, and is on the opposite side of the road, from The Thatches. As a result, the garage would not be viewed in association with the listed building or its setting and as a result it would not harm the significance of this listed building.
11. The Council in their officer report mention further listed buildings and state that these are less impacted due to an intervening modern dwelling. From the

information before me, the comments relate to the Grade II listed buildings forming No's 5 and 7 Holcombe Road (reference: 1096651), 9 Holcombe Road (reference: 1334514) and St Bernard's Cottage (reference: 1096652) on Holcombe Road. As with The Thatches, I find the setting of these buildings, to be primarily associated with their immediate gardens and relationships with the historic Holcombe Road.

12. The modest scale and discrete position of the appeal structure, set some distance to the north of these buildings, would not appear as part of their settings and would therefore not cause harm in this regard.
13. Given the above, I conclude that the proposal would not cause harm to the settings of the Grade II listed buildings (The Thatches, No's 5, 7, 9 and St Bernard's Holcombe Road). As a result, the proposal satisfies the requirements of the Act, and complies with Policies EN5, S1 and S2 of the LP which, amongst other things, require that development protects and enhance an areas heritage, maintains or enhances the historic interest of assets, and be of a high quality design that responds to the characteristics of the site.

Conditions

14. I have considered the suggested conditions in relation to the National Planning Practice Guidance. In addition to the standard time condition, it is necessary for a condition to confirm the approved plans in the interests of certainty. The Council have suggested a further condition to ensure that the boundary hedging within the site is retained and in interests of preserving the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, I find such a condition reasonable and necessary. I have amended the suggested wording for this condition to make it enforceable.

Conclusion

15. For the reasons given above, I conclude that the proposal would not harm the character or appearance of the Holcombe Conservation Area and would preserve the setting of nearby listed buildings. I therefore conclude that the appeal should be allowed.

C Rose

INSPECTOR

SCHEDULE OF CONDITIONS

- 1) The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than 3 years from the date of this decision.
- 2) The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:
 - Location Plan – drawing number S1 dated 15 June 2022
 - Site block plan and section – drawing number PL1 dated 15 June 2022
 - Proposed Site block plan and section – drawing number PL2 dated 15 June 2022
 - Proposed garage – drawing number PL3 dated 15 June 2022.
- 3) Prior to any development above ground level, details relating to the protection of the existing boundary planting to the site shall have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Thereafter, the boundary planting shall be managed and/or maintained in accordance with the approved details.