



Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 20 February 2024

by S D Castle BSc (Hons) MA MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 15th March 2024

Appeal Ref: APP/U4610/W/23/3327660
944 Broad Lane, Coventry CV5 7FG

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Ms L Bassett against the decision of Coventry City Council.
 - The application Ref PL/2023/0000967/FUL, dated 15 May 2023, was refused by notice dated 20 July 2023.
 - The development proposed is demolition of bungalow & erection of 2no. four bedroom replacement dwellings.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Preliminary Matters

2. I have taken into account the revised version of the National Planning Policy Framework ('the Framework') published in December 2023. While there have been changes to paragraph numbers since the previous iteration, the parts of the Framework most relevant in this case have not significantly changed. I am satisfied, therefore, that the revised version of the Framework does not raise new considerations necessitating further submissions from the parties.

Main Issue

3. The main issue is the effect of the proposal on the character and appearance of the area.

Reasons

4. The appeal site is located within the predominantly residential area on the northern side of Broad Lane. The existing detached bungalow at no 944 is hip-roofed and set within a relatively large plot containing several single storey outbuildings. A further detached hip-roofed bungalow (no 946) adjoins the site to the west, before a commercial car rental site interrupts the run of dwellings along Broad Lane. To the east of the site, there is a run of similar two storey semi-detached dwellings that share a consistent building line, have regular plot widths, and relatively uniform scale and form.
5. Architecturally, these semi-detached dwellings are characterised by hipped roof forms with clay tiles, bay windows, and render exterior finishes. It is notable that these semi-detached dwellings have generally not been significantly extended at two storey level to the side, giving a spacious feel to the street scene. The consistency of design, scale, layout, and spacing within this run of

semi-detached dwellings defines the prevailing character of residential dwellings on Broad Lane within which the site is viewed.

6. Whilst the existing bungalows at nos 944 and 946 do not reflect the uniform spacing and plot width of the run of semi-detached dwellings, they do sit comfortably in the street scene by virtue of their hip-roofed forms, generous spacing, and matching building line. As such, these bungalows are visually perceived as part of a wider run of dwellings that includes the semi-detached dwellings to the east.
7. The proposed dwellings would introduce notable design variation into the street scene, including by virtue of their greater width, depth, and detached form. The proposed dwellings have, however, taken design cues from the surrounding properties, including in terms of their hip-roofed appearance, rendered exterior elevations, and chimney details. Furthermore, the dwellings would be aligned consistently with Broad Lane's strong building line. These design measures would assist greatly with the sympathetic integration of the dwellings into the street scene.
8. Taken individually, therefore, I find that the dwellings are appropriately designed to harmonise with their surroundings. As a pair, however, the limited space between the dwellings would result in them appearing harmfully cramped. This cramped appearance would be visually discordant with the comfortable, and relatively consistent, spacing between buildings that characterises the nearby residential street scene. Consequently, the development would have a significantly harmful effect on the street scene, failing to respond to local character or reflect the identity of the surroundings.
9. Overall, the development would harm the character and appearance of the area and therefore conflicts with Policies H3 and DE1 of the Coventry City Council Local Plan 2017 (the LP). Among other things, these policies set out that new residential development must respect and enhance their surroundings and positively contribute towards the local identity and character of an area. The proposals also conflict with the provisions of the Framework, including paragraph 135, which requires development to be sympathetic to local character and visually attractive. The development would also conflict with the Council's Design Guidance for Residential Development insofar as it requires development to maintain the existing character of the area.

Planning Balance

10. I acknowledge that the proposal would redevelop a brownfield site and that related construction activities would create some employment. The proposal would make a limited contribution to the Government's objective of significantly boosting the supply of homes. The dwellings would be in a sustainable location with good access to services and facilities. However, given the small scale of the proposal, the benefits identified attract limited weight.
11. Weighing against these benefits would be the above identified harm to the character and appearance of the area. The Council's LP Policy DE1 seeks high quality design and is broadly consistent with the Framework insofar as the Framework also requires development to be sympathetic to the surrounding built environment. The identified conflict with the development plan therefore attracts significant weight.

12. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires applications for planning permission to be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations, including the Framework, indicate otherwise. The proposal would conflict with the development plan when read as a whole and there are no other considerations that outweigh this identified conflict.

Conclusion

13. For the reasons given above, the appeal is dismissed.

S D Castle

INSPECTOR