
Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 7 March 2024

by Rebecca McAndrew, BA Hons, MSc, PG Dip Urban Design, MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 10th April 2024

Appeal Ref: APP/Z0116/D/24/3337255

2 Broadway Avenue, Henleaze, Bristol BS9 4SU

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr Mark Heath against the decision of Bristol City Council.
 - The application Ref 23/00710/HH, dated 20 February 2023, was refused by notice dated 30 November 2023.
 - The development proposed is a hip-to-gable loft conversion with rear dormer.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Main Issue

2. The main issue is the effect of the development on the character and appearance of the site and area.

Reasons

3. Broadway Avenue is characterised by a mixture of semi-detached and detached properties which, although extended in various manners, retain their hipped roof designs. As such, the proposed hip-to-gable roof extension would give rise to a roof form which would be at odds with the character and appearance of both the appeal property and other homes within the cul de sac.
4. The proposed roof extension, combined with an overly large flat roof rear dormer, would significantly increase the overall bulk and mass of the appeal property. The dwelling occupies an elevated position at the entrance to Broadway Avenue. Therefore, this overly prominent and incongruous structure would be visible both from within the cul de sac and from certain points on West Broadway. Also, it would appear overbearing from the rear of adjoining properties 87 and 89 West Broadway as they sit at a significantly lower ground level than the appeal house.
5. In view of the above, the proposal would cause unacceptable harm to the character and appearance of the site and area. It would therefore be contrary to Policy BCS21 of the Bristol Development Framework Core Strategy (2011) and Policies DM26, DM27 and DM30 of the Site Allocations and Development Management Policies, Local Plan (2014). Taken together these seek to secure high quality design which respects the character and appearance of the host dwelling and wider area.

Other Matters

6. The appellant has referred to permitted development rights as a fallback position and has submitted drawings of a scheme which he states he would construct if this appeal were unsuccessful. Both the appeal proposal and the fallback scheme would include overly large incongruous flat roof rear dormers. However, the fallback scheme would retain the hipped roof design at the front elevation and would therefore respond better to context than the appeal proposal would. I therefore attach only moderate weight to this alternative scheme in support of allowing the appeal.
7. Whilst I recognise that a small number of properties in the wider area have hip-to-gable roof extensions, as I have described, all homes on Broadway Avenue retain their original hipped roof form. In my view, this prevailing character should be safeguarded. Also, I only have limited information before me regarding these other developments and each proposal must be considered on its own merits. As such I have found the appeal proposal would result in significant harm, as I have previously set out.
8. I note that the appellant would be willing to finish the proposed dormer in slate, rather than render. This would reduce the prominence of the dormer itself. However, it would not overcome my concerns regarding the overall impact the scheme would have on the character and appearance of the site and area.
9. I acknowledge that the appeal property is a detached house, rather than a semi-detached property. Therefore, the proposed hip to gable roof extension would not unbalance a pair of semi-detached houses. However, I afford this little weight in the face of my overall concerns regarding the proposal.

Conclusion

1. For the reasons given above I conclude that the appeal should be dismissed.

Rebecca McAndrew

INSPECTOR